

THE COUNTY COUNCIL OF THE CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

The County Council of the City & County of Cardiff met at County Hall, Cardiff on Thursday 17 April, 2014 to transact the business set out in the Council Summons dated 11 April 2014.

Present: County Councillor Derrick Morgan (Lord Mayor).

County Councillors Ali Ahmed, Manzoor Ahmed, Ali, Aubrey, Bale, Bowden, Bradbury, Bridges, Burfoot, Chaundy, Clark, Richard Cook, Corria, Cowan, Kirsty Davies, Chris Davis, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Elsmore, Evans, Ford, Goddard, Goodway, Gordon, Graham, Groves, Holden, Howells, Hudson, Hunt, Hyde, Javed, Keith Jones, Margaret Jones, Joyce, Kelloway, Knight, Lent, Lloyd, Lomax, Love, Magill, Marshall, McEvoy, McKerlich, Merry, Michael, Mitchell, Murphy, Parry, Patel, Phillips, David Rees, Dianne Rees, Robson, Sanders, Simmons, Stubbs, Benjamin Thomas, Graham Thomas, Huw Thomas, Thorne, Walker, Walsh, Weaver, Craig Williams, Darren Williams and Woodman

Apologies: County Councillors Ralph Cook, Carter, Govier, Hinchey and McGarry

182: WEBCASTING AND RECORDING OF PROCEEDINGS

Members were reminded of a decision of the Constitution Committee on 10 July, 2008 to webcast the Council meeting. Members were also reminded that the Constitution Committee had previously agreed that Council proceedings be recorded for administrative purposes.

Formal approval to record the proceedings was granted.

183: MINUTES

RESOLVED - That the minutes of the meetings held on 27 March 2014 were approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairperson, subject to the following amendments:

Minute no 169:

- Councillor Walsh asked for the passing of Bill Tobbutt to be noted.

Minute no 172:

- Councillor David Walker proposed the nomination of Councillor Margaret Jones as Lord Mayor.
- Councillor Judith Woodman proposed the nomination of Deputy Lord Mayor Ali Ahmed and this was seconded by Councillor Phil Bale

Minute no 175: Constitution Committee

- The Report was approved subject to the amendment listed in Amendment Sheet.
- The Recommendation as listed in the report was agreed.

Minute no 177: Notice of Motion.

- That the voting order of the original Notice of Motion be re-arranged to reflect the vote taken as listed for the amendment.

#### 184: DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The Lord Mayor reminded Members of their responsibility under Article 10 of the Members' Code of Conduct to declare any interest, & to complete Personal Interest forms, at the commencement of the item of business.

The following declarations were made:

<u>Councillor</u>	<u>Item</u>	<u>Interest</u>
Councillor Holden	Item 10 – Notice of Motion	Personal interest - former member of CAHA, previous site secretary Flaxland Allotments, current allotment member at Rhydypenau

Allotments

185: ANNOUNCEMENTS

1. Marketing Innovation award for Central Library

Congratulations to everyone that helped with Central Library being crowned winner of the Joint Marketing Project of the Year at the recent all Wales Marketing Innovation Awards. The award was recognition for the hard work that went in to organising the Japan Day that was staged at the library last May. The library team worked with staff in the Council's Communications and Media to come up with the marketing material that helped promote the event.

Japan Day showcased Japanese Culture to attract visitors and new members to the library and bring the Cardiff's Japanese community and Library Service closer together. The event was delivered through a partnership with Welsh School of Architecture, University of Wales, the Cardiff-Japanese Community and Routes into Languages – Cymru. The day featured hand bell performances by children from the Japanese Saturday school in Cardiff, tea ceremonies, animation and language workshops, a kimono fashion show, kendo performances that took place outside the library (watched by 250 people), storytelling, poetry readings, Haiku workshops and Japanese instruments demonstrations. The event attracted 3.500 visitors in total.

Judge's Comments: "Cardiff has done it again! A high quality demonstration of how to do marketing by using user groups and available contacts. Your ability to leverage contacts is always impressive but you really do make the most of them. Yet again your entry will enter my collection of marketing excellence case studies. The fact that you also market internally is an illustration of excellent marketing management"

A fantastic achievement – well done to everyone involved.

2. It is with great regret that I have to report that Councillor Mary McGarry's mother has passed away.

3. Also, that former Councillor Alexandrina (Alex) Evans passed away peacefully at the University Hospital of Wales on Saturday 5 April 2014.

Alex Evans represented the Splott/Tremorfa Ward for four years between 2004 and 2008. I understand Alex's funeral will take place at Thornhill Cemetery at 12:45 on Tuesday 22 April.

4. Condolences to Councillor Eleanor Sanders, whose father recently passed away.

#### 186: PUBLIC QUESTIONS

#### ENVIROMENT QUESTION

Question: *Douglas Anthony*

Can the Cabinet Member confirm that the Council will make Cardiff's Allotment Service self-financing by the year 2015-6?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

Yes, the intention is to remove the subsidy, currently £31,650 in this financial year, and make the allotment service self-financing by 2015/16.

However, some further work is required to ensure that the removal of the subsidy does not impact disproportionately on any one group of plot holders and if this means extending the reduction over a longer period of time, possibly into 2016/17, then we will give the matter our full consideration.

We should be in a position to confirm the timetable by the end of the budget setting process for the next allotment year.

Supplementary Question: *Douglas Anthony*

Briefly, first of all I would like to thank the Cabinet Member for his answer to my question, but I do wonder whether Councilors are aware of exactly what it means on the ground as it were, i.e., to the people most concerned, that is plot holders when he says that the Allotment Service will be self-financing by 2015/16.

I have some figures in front of me if I could be permitted a moment just to pick the bones out of them and try to explain what the Cabinet

Members reply means in terms of ...the question is coming .. What becoming self-financing means is that the current net expenditure of the Allotment Service, something like £70,000 last year will have to be made up of rent increases. The current rent per plot for this year is £10.28 per perch, we still use perches in the allotment world. To meet the deficit of something a little short of £70,000 that is the difference between annual revenue and income would mean an increase of the price per perch to, by my calculations, to £17.03 per perch from the current £10.28, an increase of close on 70% and that is on top of 33% we have already experienced between last year and the current year. My question is are Councillors happy with the idea that the way the rents are going up is altering the whole appearance of the allotment movement in Cardiff; the rate they are going up is against the ethos and certainly the history of the allotment movement where it was supposed to be a movement that was available to the mass of the people and its rapidly approaching the stage, under a Labour administration I should say, ironically, where perhaps it is becoming the hobby of choice of a very moneyed few. Are we happy with this state of affairs?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

The answer to your question is no we are not happy, but in a period when we have had to make £50m worth of cuts there is lots of service areas which are having problems in terms of having to balance budgets. From a personal perspective I did use to have an allotment myself so I am well aware of the difficulties faced by allotment holders. What I would say is that my understanding is that we are getting more people applying for plots year on year and my hope is that obviously the higher the number of people we have got with allotments the less per person they will have to pay for that service, and that is my hope moving forward.

## 187: PETITIONS

The following petitions were submitted:

Councillor Robson – with reference to the petition handed into Council on 27 March 2014, a further 211 signatures in respect of petition opposing the changes to the 21 and 23 Bus Service bringing the total to 1413.

Councillor McEvoy – petition calling on Brains Brewery to continue to look after its customers in Fairwater and work with local people to use the Rugby club Site for the benefit of the community, whilst recognising their commercial interest.

Councillor McEvoy – petition calling on the Council to:

- plan purposefully and proactively in order to meet the increasing demand for Welsh Medium Education across the city. This should include honouring the promise to establish a brand new Welsh primary school in the Grangetown area to open in 2015;
- ensure all Council leisure centres, libraries and youth centres provide their services through the medium of Welsh, especially their leisure and social activities for young people;
- ensure that all holders of frontline council jobs are completely bilingual, in order to enable the Council to provide a comprehensive service through the medium of Welsh when interacting with the public. Any external or third party commission to provide a service on behalf of the council should commit to the Welsh language as a condition of their contract;
- re-establish its grant to Tafwyl and reverse its cuts to Menter Caerdydd.

Councillor Sanders – petition containing 135 signatures requesting improvements to be carried out on the pathway between Heol Briwnant & Heol Uchaf, together with photographs.

Councillor Ford – with reference to a petition handed in at Council on 27 March 2013, a further 130 signatures opposing the closure of the Waungron Road Refuse Recycling Centre.

Councillor Gordon – with reference to a petition handed in at Council on 27 February opposing any further ‘Best Parties Ever’ in Cardiff, a further 50 signatures now asking that the decision to allow the application by ‘Best Parties Ever’ to be rescinded.

Councillor Mitchell – petition of over 300 signatures asking to be heard at any Planning Committee considering an application to build a supermarket on the Bulldog, Fairwater site.

## 188: STATEMENT OF THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL

### Meeting with Minister for Finance

Earlier today I met with the Minister for Finance, Jane Hutt, at the Welsh Government. Given the difficult financial climate, I reinforced the message to the Minister that salami-slicing budgets and reducing services is not a future I, or anybody, would want for local government.

Instead, I believe that we need to develop new ways of working, and crucially new ways of funding many services. From our part, this will require a combination of imagination and innovation but it will also require the Welsh Government to build on the recommendations of the Silk Commission and, over time, devolve more power and responsibilities to local government and to foster a more resilient funding model to support our public services.

### Co-operative Council's Innovation Network

I am delighted to announce that Cardiff City Council has become a member of the Co-operative Councils Innovation Network. Joining this network will help us to learn best practice from other authorities. As Members will be aware I believe that as a Council we need to work more closely with people and communities to understand their needs in order to design more tailored and efficient services and it was interesting to learn about the innovative solutions that are being pursued by other network councils across the UK during a recent visit from a representative of the network. It was also evident that there were good examples of best practice here in Cardiff, from which others can learn.

It is my intention to invite Welsh local authorities here to Cardiff to learn more about the Co-operative Councils Innovation Network and the opportunities of adopting a 'Co-operative Council' approach here in Wales.

### Neighbourhood Partnerships

I was pleased to attend the induction session for the six members who will be taking up a new lead role in the Neighbourhood

Partnerships. These partnerships which see the Council working alongside partners from across the public services exemplify the co-operative approach.

### City of Cardiff Council

I believe that we need to put the 'city' back in to Cardiff Council. This Council exists for the people of Cardiff, and the people who work for the Council are very proud of this fact. Rebuilding the link between the Council and the city and re-igniting that civic pride in our staff and our communities will be an important part of my Cabinet's agenda for Cardiff and I am keen to ensure that moving forward our name reflects this. Therefore it is my aspiration that we become known as the City of Cardiff Council.

It is well known that globally cities have become magnets for smart people, companies and investment. And so when we're talking to audiences around the world this is something that we really need to emphasise.

The Leader also clarified that the change in the Neighbourhood Partnership structure will mean there will be greater Member involvement; advice has been sought in relation to the change of name, it is simply a branding exercise in terms of the Council itself, it is still the City and County of Cardiff and that we have a very diverse city; it is important that the distinction between the Co-Operative Council and the Co-Op Group is made clear, the Co-Operative Council relates to the relationship which exists between the Council and our communities.

## 189: COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT, CO-OPERATIVES & SOCIAL ENTERPRISE STATEMENT

### Neighbourhood Partnerships

On Tuesday this week, the Leader and I attended an induction session for the new Neighbourhood Partnership arrangements.

The Neighbourhood Partnership approach is important for Cardiff as it provides a structured way of bringing people, service providers and decision makers closer together to develop tailored solutions for local



communities. This approach allows us to engage meaningfully with local people and communities and will help us unlock the ideas and energy of local people.

I was hugely encouraged by the enthusiasm and commitment of all those who attended and I would like to thank all those involved, in particular the lead elected members for each area:

- Cllr Derrick Morgan for Cardiff East
- Cllr Roderick McKerlich for Cardiff West
- Cllr Garry Hunt for Cardiff North
- Cllr Sarah Merry for Cardiff South East
- Cllr Iona Gordon for Cardiff South West
- Cllr Eleanor Sanders for Cardiff City and South

These Members will play a key part in ensuring that local communities have a voice in shaping the priorities for their area and will help promote the role of elected members as community champions. Neighbourhood Partnerships will allow us to work more closely with other service providers outside of the Council.

I am therefore looking forward to working with you all, and seeing the impacts of productive local partnerships over the coming months.

#### UEFA European Football Championships Final Tournament (EURO2020)

I am pleased to announce to Council that Cardiff Council has confirmed its partnership commitment to supporting the Football Association of Wales bid to become one of the 13 cities to host the UEFA European Football Championships Final Tournament (EURO2020) in 2020. The 2020 event will celebrate the 60th anniversary of this international event and has been designed by UEFA to be a tournament for the European family providing, for most people, a once in a lifetime opportunity to experience the EURO Championships near their home. If the FAW are successful in the bidding process the costs to the Council will be capped and will not be payable until 2020. The economic benefit of staging this world class football championship promises to realise over £40m in economic benefit to Cardiff. I am sure Members will want to join me in wishing the FAW every success with their bid.

St Mary Street - Saturday Market

A continuation of the Saturday St Mary Street Market, has been agreed with the operators and stall holders of the market, consequently there will be a seamless continuity of this on street retail activity. The Council will remove the burden of a license fee, benefitting stall holders and making it easier to attract additional traders.

Together the council will continue to develop the content, and size of the market with the operator and existing stall holders, to deliver a critical mass of stalls (up to 40 is desirable) to enhance the proposition available for the public. A review process will take place in 12 months.

The council will endeavour to deliver more on street activities, in order to continue the development of the Castle Quarter, to support footfall and increase overall sales for independent operators."

Cardiff ECOS 'Local Heroes' tribute

As part of the European Capital of Sport Year, Cardiff Council hosted a Local Sporting Heroes event on Tuesday 8 April 2014 at Grangetown library. I was delighted to welcome the Rugby Football League to take part in its 'Local Sporting Heroes' project, which aims to honour forgotten stars of the past. The first in the series took place in Grangetown Library on Tuesday, 8 April, and featured the Whitcombe brothers, George and Frank.

They were two of ten children who were born and raised in 52, Wedmore Road, Grangetown. George played professional football for Cardiff City, Stockport County, Port Vale and Notts County and also captained Wales at baseball whilst Frank played 123 games for Broughton Rangers and then a further 331 for Northern – 454 games in 14 seasons around WW2 and won 14 caps for Wales.

Mike Nicholas, president of the Wales Rugby League, joined the Whitcombe family and Simon Foster, son of Bradford Northern legend Trevor, in paying tribute to Frank, while the former Daily Mail rugby union correspondent, Peter Jackson, was among the key note speakers.

RHS Show, Cardiff

The RHS Spring Flower Show celebrated its 10<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Show in Cardiff with 20, 922 paying visitors plus approximately 2,000 children and around 30 members of the press. This was 3% up on 2013 having benefited from significantly improved weather conditions. The show featured 7 show gardens including the Gold Medal and Best in Show winning garden designed for the visually impaired which is being donated to the city. This garden was visited by the Lord Mayor when unveiling a Welsh flagged JCB which is going to be used in a mammoth trek from John O'Groats to Land's End to raise funds for a permanent sensory garden to be built in Wales for the benefit of blind ex-servicemen. Over 250 exhibitors and traders were present at the Cardiff show – the largest number in its 10 year history and included some who had featured throughout the ten years. Good press coverage was received including two visits from ITV, the BBC One Show and S4C. The breakdown of the show continues apace in Bute Park with final equipment removal to be completed after the Easter weekend.

#### 190: EARLY YEARS, CHILDREN & FAMILIES STATEMENT

I am obviously very pleased to take on a critically important portfolio as the Cabinet Member for Early years, Children & Families. As the new title indicates I am determined to ensure that we take a clear and joined up strategic approach to meeting the needs of the most vulnerable children in Cardiff. This approach has to ensure that we make the most of our scarce resources to maximise the preventative impact of work with children in their early years so that more and more of them can lead fulfilled lives in their families and fewer children enter the looked after system.

I have been very encouraged by the significant strides that have evidently been made by Councillor Cook, Councillor Corria and the Director with his team, to put children's services on a secure and stable footing and to develop some strong and forward thinking strategic initiatives in laying the foundations for success. There have been some recent signs of improved capacity and recruitment, but I am under no illusion that the challenge remains very significant. That said I am confident that with continued commitment and focus, we will embed and accelerate the progress during the next 12 months and see that reflected in performance overall and in improved lives for the children we support.

190: ORAL QUESTIONS

CORPORATE SERVICES AND PERFORMANCE QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Clark*

Will you confirm that the Labour ruling administration will keep the pledge they made prior to the 2012 Local Government Elections that the Council Tax increase in 2015/16 “will be less than 2%”?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

You will recall that the pledge in question was subject to “all things being equal”. Clearly, that is not the case as demonstrated by the Council’s need to find £48 million in budget savings in 2014/15. We will also have to find more than £30 million in savings of course in 2015/16 as well and future years beyond that.

We will therefore propose the level of Council Tax to Council in February next year in the context of the Council’s financial position and budget as a whole following extensive public consultation and confirmation of the final Local Government Financial Settlement for 2015/16.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Clark*

I note that your reply hasn’t given a definite commitment to keep the Labour promise to not increase Council Tax by more than 2% next year. None of the media coverage or leaflets I have seen, and I have got a stash here, issued by Labour to Cardiff’s residents before the 2012 local government elections Referred to these weasely words ‘all things being equal’ the leaflets simply promised that increases will be less than 2%. Do you agree with me that the voters of Cardiff have been misled by Labour?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

No I absolutely don’t agree and as I said in my earlier response you have to appreciate that if the UK coalition government was not doing what it

was doing to local government across the country this city would not be in the position it finds itself in.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Walker*

What a pathetic rally rousing response that was as the new leader of the council. Are you aware that in England most Councils, certainly those that are not labour, have frozen Council Tax and at a time when people are finding things difficult, difficult to make ends meet, I would have thought it was incumbent upon this Council to try and achieve this same aim, particularly as you made it part of your manifesto pledge. Will you actually make it an ambition to make it to that 2% you promised because it sounds from the answer you gave to Councillor Clark, as if it was no way are we going to do this because there are all sorts of other problems ahead, I think it would be excellent for the citizens of Cardiff for you to say we are going to try very hard, it is our ambition to meet the target we promised and not fuzz the whole issue as you have just done

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I think the most important point is that when we make the decisions ahead is that we try to share the burden across all those communities, the staff and we will continue to do that in as much of a fair and equitable way as possible when we make the very difficult decisions ahead and in partnership with our communities as I have said in this meeting and also in my maiden speech as well.

QUESTION TO THE LEADER (ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND PARTNERSHIPS)

Question: *County Councillor Walker*

The existence of rival factions and ideological differences within your Group is well known culminating in the recent leadership contest which you won. What will be the key differences which you, as Leader, and the refreshed cabinet will bring to the leadership of the Council which will differentiate you from your predecessors? Or can we expect more of the same? Your statement to the last Council did not suggest any fundamental shifts in policy or direction.

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

In my inaugural address to Council last month I set out a new vision for ‘Cardiff to be Europe’s most liveable capital city’ which sets a clear new direction for both the Council and for the city.

For me, this will mean creating a city for people – designing and developing the city in a way which puts people first.

It’s also about delivering services with people – working with people and communities to design and deliver their services, allowing us to respond to tackle shared problems together and strengthen relationships with and between our communities.

To my mind, this signals a new approach for the Council. The Cabinet and I have also put ‘openness’ at the heart of our approach. We intend to be open in our decision making and to engage in important conversations with people about how services are delivered and the difficult decisions that will need to now be taken.

Above all, we want to strengthen relationships between the Council and the city and between ward members and their communities.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Walker*

Can I ask you why it is that your predecessors in Cabinet did not apparently see that as a priority? If that is something new what was it about it that they did not like as they did not have it as a priority? Because I am puzzled, that somehow you are trying to differentiate between yourselves and your predecessors in a way that is ill-defined. Because I think otherwise we all have to ask ourselves what was the point of all that turmoil in the Labour Group over the last year and a half, two years, what was the point if we are just getting a few refinements to what was there before?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

Cllr Walker I have to emphasise that if we are going to take this city forward through the challenging times ahead then every Member of this Chamber has a collective responsibility as well and I have to say the wording of your question is really, really .... I find it totally unnecessary

and it actually does not send a very good signal to people in the city that your party is really serious about working with communities and not playing party politics with peoples services and people's lives so I would ask you, I would ask you to respect the fact that and acknowledge indeed that since October the financial situation that the Welsh Government had and that this Council has had has deteriorated and we are having to reflect that in the difficult decisions that this Council is also having to take.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Bridges*

It is often said that something is meaningless if the reverse is unthinkable and I have scribbled down some of the things you have said there Councillor Bale – putting people first, but I cannot imagine you would talk about putting the people of Cardiff last, I would hope not. You talk about tackling shared problems together, again the reverse seems unthinkable, to be as open as possible, again I can't imagine that you would argue that we wouldn't be as open as possible and that we should have honest conversations with people and again I can't imagine you would promote being dishonest with the people of Cardiff and I just wonder given that when we might actually see something of substance and of meaning and value in terms of your plans for the city rather than platitudes which I think is what you have come up with there.

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I think if I was to look back on the 8 years of Lib Dem rule in this city and look at things like the Rumney Rec decision that you took under your administration that I would be saying that, to actually to hear you say that, actually I take that with a pinch of salt.

CORPORATE SERVICES AND PERFORMANCE QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Robson*

Will you be introducing a budget line for the construction of new bus shelters?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel* (on behalf of County Councillor Hinchey)

Whilst there isn't currently a separate budget line for the construction of bus shelters, the new Bus Shelters Agreement incorporating commercial advertising will provide additional income streams to the Council. This may provide scope to identify funding for new bus shelters over the life of the contract.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Robson*

One thing that everyone will be aware of that there have been a lot of cuts to bus services this month, about to start, and it is incumbent upon this Council to do everything it can to support bus services so that people can use them so I would urge you to look at actually introducing a specific line, I appreciate the answer you gave about advertising revenue but that is not going to generate a lot of income to do much about this, many people in many parts of this city would like to actually stand waiting for a bus in the dry in the awful weather we have had this winter and therefore they would use it, the bus would become that little but more attractive for them and hopefully we could start to address some of the problems with the cuts we have just had.

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I fully understand the concerns that you have got same as my constituents and the same for most of the constituents around the city. Obviously the people who are using these bus shelters, especially in the bad weather, want some form of shelter. One of the avenues which we do use, which is Section 106 money, as you well appreciate, if there is justification for it, we use that money for bus shelters as well.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Craig Williams*

I want to ask you about the biggest bus shelter of all and where on earth and when we are going to bet our Bus Station in Cardiff and whether this new administration will be delivering it, as promised in your manifesto north of the Central Train Station or will you still be going South?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

It's still a priority for us and we are still looking at it.



TRANSPORT, PLANNING AND SUSTAINABILITY QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

Will the Cabinet member rule out the option of the Rapid Transport Corridor from Waterhall Road to the town centre and the option of re-opening the disused rail line through Fairwater in relation to the Local Development Plan due to come back to Council?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I need to make it clear to you, in terms of the current state of evidence regarding potential tram or bus routes there is currently no clear evidence to support any specific option, proposal or recommendation in a positive or negative way.

Also, before any options were to be considered, a very significant amount of further study and feasibility work would be needed in terms of costs, routes and practicality before proposals would in any way be defined and could be presented to the Council and the public in a wider consultation. However, we are determined that the best long-term solution for the people of Cardiff will be found.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

I note that you don't rule it out when you had the opportunity to let people in Canton know that. I would just like to draw your attention to what you said about it being an option or plural, options and what you said in the Echo, the options it seems have no substance or denying any substance and its totally unfounded. Could you please explain the contradiction, you were quite shy to do so earlier maybe you could do so now?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

There is no contradiction as I have very clearly stated last month and this month there is currently no clear evidence to support any specific option. That is very clear.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Aubrey*

As I have said previously every draft of every LDP that has been proposed by this Council has included something along this line although as you say with no actual specific option. The one thing those plans as they have developed haven't included is any specific reference to how much of the deliverability of proposals in this are relates to these routed. When we see the final version of the LDP later this year will there be some correlation between how many houses we can put on these sites and the level of transport we can put through that corridor?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

As you are well aware there will be a paper coming to council which is in June and all the information will be in those papers as well.

#### HEALTH, HOUSING AND WELLBEING QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Darren Williams*

Could you provide an estimate of the average number of people sleeping rough in Cardiff on a given day?

Reply: *County Councillor Elsmore*

May I commend Councillor Williams on his use of language. In responding, I, too, will refer to people who sleep rough, rather than use the homogenous term of rough sleepers. We are, after all, talking about individuals all of whom are worthy of respect.

Now to your question: during 2013, the average number of people sleeping rough in Cardiff on a given day was 11: with a high of 31, and a low of 2.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Darren Williams*

I am sure you will agree with me that even one person sleeping rough is too many not least because it is just the most visible symptom of a far wider problem and that problem is exacerbated by austerity. David Cameron said in 2008 it is a disgrace for people to be sleeping on the streets in the fifth biggest economy in the world but recent figures show that in England the number of people sleeping rough has increased by

37% since 2010. In this challenging context what is Cardiff Council, together with its partner agencies, doing to alleviate the problem of rough sleeping and to help those affected into safe supported accommodation?

Reply: *County Councillor Elsmore*

Well I can share, in a way, some good news in the sense that for the first quarter of this year, the figures are, the daily average was 8, there clearly is a downward trend. What I can say is that these figures are monitored very closely by our services to ensure that that downward trend is maintained and you have asked then what services are available to help people who are sleeping rough. We have got Outreach Services who are actually in touch with individuals sleeping rough; they actively support them to access accommodation through the Gateway Scheme, the Rough Sleeper Project and other sources.

Appropriate intervention arrangements are also in place with other statutory and third sector services, including South Wales Police. What I can say is that the number of people sleeping rough remains relatively low in Cardiff for a major city. I am thinking about what you were saying about comparators in England. This demonstrates the effectiveness of services and joint working in Cardiff.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Woodman*

Would the Cabinet Member encourage councillors to go and see some of this service provision first hand? Particularly the night bus, which is usually parked opposite City Hall on a regular basis dealing with people who are homeless and sleeping on our streets.

Would the Cabinet Member confirm if this administration is continuing collecting EU stats, and for those who don't know what that is, it is a collection of information, because we are so good at dealing with homeless in this city people migrate here from other authorities because the fact they know we deal with the problem very well. Finally, yes, we do have a downward trend and I believe, and I am sure you will agree with me it was the foresight of our administration in building the single assessment centre to actually deal with this problem.

Reply: *County Councillor Elsmore*

I absolutely would encourage all Members of the Chamber to visit first hand services that are providing support to these people sleeping rough. I certainly am going to make it a priority in terms of my position. I am well aware of the Night bus. In terms of your technical point around the EU stats I will return to you. I think it is wonderful there is a downward trend.

QUESTION TO THE LEADER (ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND PARTNERSHIPS)

Question: *County Councillor Boyle*

Will there be a new corporate plan to reflect the reorganisation of cabinet portfolios?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I just wanted to be clear that the changes to the portfolios were implemented to encourage more cross-portfolio working amongst Cabinet members – breaking down silos - something I believe will be vital in tackling many of the complex, cross-service area issues that we are facing.

As you will also be aware, the current Corporate Plan for 2014-2017 was approved by Council back in February. There are no plans to develop a new Corporate Plan for the current financial year, but I would expect to bring forward a refreshed version of this document in early 2015 following the Cardiff Convention and the budget consultation process later this year.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Boyle*

I certainly don't disagree with the breaking down of silos, but slightly alarming to hear that there is going to be another version in a years' time. It was the Peer Review, just 9 months or 8 months ago that highlighted the importance of the Corporate Plan in establishing a consistent message and it said and I quote – “the immediate tasks”, i.e., back then – “the immediate tasks are to establish clear roles, clear responsibilities, set clear targets and pin point clear accountability as these requirements are paramount” and yet you have radically reorganised the Cabinet structure,

muddying many of the former lines of communication that existed just a month ago, and outside the inner circle roles and responsibilities aren't clear, the job titles are woolly, they don't match up with the Corporate Plan and accountability in terms of the Corporate Plan's targets are vaguer than they were and the light of their comment how do you think the Peer Review Team would react to your changes.

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I am certainly not going to second guess what the Peer Review Team would make of those changes, I feel quite comfortable that the changes I have made are beneficial to Cabinet Members to get a broader interaction with Directors across the Council. There has been no changes to the actual management structure in place of the Council that still falls very much under the responsibility of the Chief Executive and I disagree in terms of the Corporate Plan as well, I think we need to move away from looking at documents that are fixed in stone for a number of years, we need to have a regular annual refresh of some of the documents to make sure that they reflect some of the fast moving developments that are taking place, not just in the Cardiff but right across the country at the present time.

Supplementary Question: *Councillor Bowden*

Following on from what Councillor Boyle has said will there be a new plan which will reflect the different priorities that your new Cabinet has got because there are some changes, I am sure, within your leadership and perhaps, for example, how you will be taking forward partnering arrangements perhaps in the area of culture, leisure, sport?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

The three priorities that the administration has are not changing so they are still very much at the heart of what the administration is seeking to achieve but we do, and I did say this previously, we have got a forth issue, I have discussed this with Councillor Walker and other Members that we have to look at how we organise ourselves as an organisation, how we do partner with others in the City to help us to look at how we provide services in the future and I dare say you will see some of that reflected in the narrative of the Corporate Plan but not necessarily changing some of the outcomes in it going forward.

ENVIRONMENT QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor McKerlich*

The recent consultation demonstrated that the people of Cardiff are strongly opposed to black bin collections being reduced to a 4 week cycle instead of the current fortnightly collection. As you claim to be a listening and responsive executive, will you take this opportunity to rule out this dilution of service at least until after the Council elections in 2017?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

I don't think you will be surprised to hear that I am not prepared to rule anything out that far ahead; especially that it might not be me who is taking those sorts of decisions, but the consultation exercise is just one part of the decision making process.

As I advised at Council last month, the detailed business planning analysis for costs, recycling participation and performance modelling is still underway.

Until we have these results, no decisions can be fully and robustly considered.

I can however rule out moving to a 4-weekly black bag collection during the current financial year.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor McKerlich*

We have had a consultation; the reply was absolutely clear, what is the point in having a consultation if it is just going to be set aside.

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

I don't think in my reply I said anything about consultations being set aside Councillor, what I said was that it was one part of the decision making process. As I have said for this current year I certainly can rule it out, for this current year, but I think it would be wrong of me, given the

cuts that we are facing in the years ahead, to rule anything out at this stage.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

At the last Cabinet Meeting you said that you had instructed Officers to remove the full contribution of a Member to the document that was before the Cabinet so that the Member had put forward a consultation, had put forward something in full to the Consultation, just asking you really before you do that again will you maybe think, think very very carefully?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

I am not really sure of what your question is, perhaps you could drop me a line later and let me know what the issue is, I don't see what it has got to do with this particular question that I have been asked.

QUESTION TO THE LEADER (ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND PARTNERSHIPS)

Question: *County Councillor Sanders*

The Cabinet, at its meeting on 10th April 2014, agreed to the establishment of a joint Local Service Board with the Vale of Glamorgan. Will the cabinet member set out the assumed benefits of this decision, particularly making reference to the What Matters 10 year strategy and how this approach will enhance its delivery for the city?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

A Joint Local Service Board with the Vale of Glamorgan Council will firstly assist in simplifying our partnership structures and reducing the number of meetings and duplication that exists.

In establishing joint-working, we have been very clear as a Cabinet that it should only take place where there is a strong business case and that any cross-boundary working will not detract from addressing the local priorities and concerns of our communities.

In that context, we will soon be refreshing the 'What Matters' 10-year strategy. This strategy will reflect the current priorities facing the city and also using our newly established Neighbourhood Partnerships to work with partners and communities to respond to need and work together to develop new solutions.

These new arrangements I believe that we will have effective delivery structures in place at a local, city-wide and regional level.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Saunders*

I obviously welcome any joint working that enhances any improvements but how will you ensure that, given the desire for joint working that Cardiff residents will continue to receive the priority that your administration is setting out and not having it potentially watered down?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I think the work of both structures that exist in the Vale and in Cardiff, you will find that many of the outcomes are shared and I think it is very important that we do work with organisations and with partners across Cardiff and the Vale where there is clear rationale for doing so. The BDO report that was commissioned to look into this made very clear recommendations, they have been endorsed by the Vale of Glamorgan's Cabinet and now our own and I think we need to work positively going forward with those new arrangements.

#### ENVIRONMENT QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Ford*

Will the Cabinet Member resolve to keep open the Waungron Road Recycling Centre?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

The Council took the decision to move to two larger sites in the city with enhanced facilities for household waste recycling as part of the 2014/15 Budget that was agreed in February. Options for the future use of the site are currently being considered.



Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Ford*

You have got signs up now saying the recycling centre is closing, I handed a petition in with hundreds of signatures and the last Council. Can you tell me whether you intend to demolish the site completely and how much it will cost and what you do intend to do with the site if the recycling centre is closed.

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

If you heard my reply, I think I will repeat the final sentence. Options for the future use of the site are currently being considered. That does not say anything about demolition; it talks about options and consideration.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor McKerlich*

I am concerned about the provision of household waste recycling centres in the north of the city. For a significant period of time there will not be any and in the event that Wedal Road does not get planning permission and it is being fiercely contested by local residents then you appear to have closed one without having any plan in place to replace it. Now doesn't it send out a very poor message to people who are opposing the Wedal Road transformation that you appear to be prejudging what the Planning Committee will decide?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

As a former member of the Planning Committee Councillor I am sure that I am not going to do any decision making that will actually prejudge what the Planning Committee actually said. But nevertheless the Budget Committee process was fully scrutinised and was put forward as part of our decision making process for the Council and what has been agreed is what is being put in place.

HEALTH, HOUSING AND WELLBEING QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Davis*

Can the Cabinet Member inform the chamber the steps that are taken to assist a Council tenant before the Bailiffs are sent into a person's home?

Reply: *County Councillor Elsmore*

Let me assure the Chamber that the Council doesn't send bailiffs into a council tenant's home. Neither does the Council employ bailiffs to recover rent.

Indeed, the Housing Service has an extremely proactive approach to preventing rent arrears, taking early action to stop arrears accumulating. Home visits are used (to ensure that housing benefit is paid). In the main, this allows for problems to be resolved, and affordable repayment agreements to be put in place.

Before legal action is taken, the tenant is given the opportunity to attend a Rent Panel to discuss arrears with senior officers. Here every effort is made to understand and resolve problems, and a further agreement to repay is usually made.

If after all these modes of support, the matter goes before the County Court for eviction for rent arrears, it is the County Court bailiffs who are responsible for carrying out the possession order.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Davis*

Given the vulnerability of these tenants can you assure me that the County Court Enforcement Officers are able to respond, able to understand how vulnerable these people are and are not going in there to heavy handed?

Reply: *County Councillor Elsmore*

What I would say of course is I would anticipate that any Enforcement Agent would be working sensibly with individuals and as you say these people are very vulnerable indeed. This is going to always be particularly agonising times for them. That is always for the County Court and what I would say that each eviction a Council officer will also be present to act as an intermediary.

QUESTION TO THE LEADER (ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND PARTNERSHIPS)

Question: *County Councillor Aubrey*

Co-operation with our city's neighbours is clearly crucial to achieving both the new administration's co-operative agenda and the goals of the Williams Commission proposals for local government in Wales. The commission's proposals suggest that it is far more important for us to co-operate with Llantwit Major than with Llantwit Fardre and this was enthusiastically supported by the previous administration under Cllr Joyce. Does the Leader also support the re-establishment of South Glamorgan County Council and the Williams Commission's proposals in general?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

We are of course waiting on the response from the Welsh Government to the Commission's recommendations and how these might be progressed.

Whatever the final recommendations, co-operation between Cardiff and the Vale of Glamorgan will continue. I am due to meet with the Leader and Managing Director of the Vale of Glamorgan Council next week where I aim to discuss how we can take this partnership forward.

And for me, though the Williams Commission was silent on this issue, pursuing the city-region agenda in the Cardiff Capital Region is vital for the future development of Cardiff, the Valleys and the Vale. And so I see a future where we will be working with both Llantwit Major and Llantwit Fardre.

I would also add that Williams was much more than just lines on maps, there were significant amounts in that report looking at performance and benchmarking and how we can raise equality of public services across Wales and that too is an agenda I am looking to embrace.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Aubrey*

I agreed there is a lot in the Williams Commission to support, but I think that the characterisation, the accurate characterisation of the Williams

Commission attitude to lines is that it doesn't want to think about them at all because that is a terribly scary thing to do, lest we scare everybody off.

The lines really do matter and it really does matter, we have had an example only this week where we have been talking about cross working and catchment areas in Taffs Well, where the problem seemed to me, and nobody seemed to say it, that the problem wasn't that the catchment area crossed the boundary, it was that we had a long standing problem where Taffs Well was considered to be completely separate from Cardiff when it is only separated by a river.

Will you undertake to have similar meetings to the meetings with the Vale with our other partners, from Rhondda Cynon Taff and in Caerphilly to make sure that we are not tying ourselves to a horse which is clearly running off with the Williams Commission agenda, purely on the basis of what is politically easiest and what is easiest to achieve?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I do of course intend to, and it may take me some time because the diary is looking very full at the moment, I do intend to get to meet leaders of Councils across the region in due course, the Vale is the first of many. This issue is very much in the hands of Welsh Government but in the meantime I am certainly looking to work with and cooperate with our neighbours as much as possible.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Goodway*

I declare my interest as the Vice Chair of the Cardiff Capital Region Advisory Board. Notwithstanding the reasoning you put forward in answer to previous questions about the rebranding and renaming of the Council which I trust that I will get an opportunity to debate in the appropriate forum at some time in the future. Would you agree that it is a very hostile statement, at a time when we have just got agreement from our neighbours to the use of the term Cardiff Capital Region, to re-emphasise the City rather than the Region and will he accept that in terms of our Governments proposals on Local Government reorganisation residents of the Vale of Glamorgan will see his comments as a most hostile act at this time.

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I certainly don't believe that residents in the Vale will see that as a hostile act at all. I think we can get caught up a great deal in a name, the most important thing; I met with Leaders through the WLGA Regional Board recently. There was a strong message coming from those Leaders that we need to work together much more to take the city region agenda forward, whatever we want to call the regional organisation that does that, the governance structure will evolve over time and I am looking forward to working with the Minister and with others to make sure that we get the best deal for South East Wales through this initiative.

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT, CO-OPERATIVES AND SOCIAL ENTERPRISE QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Graham*

Despite the efforts of the previous leadership, Llanishen and Lisvane reservoirs still remain unopen to the public. Will the new Leader explain why Lisvane Reservoir is fenced off and will he commit to reopening Lisvane Reservoir as soon as possible?

Reply: *County Councillor Bradbury*

The fencing in question at the Lisvane Reservoir was erected by the previous landowner and received the support of Natural Resources Wales (formerly the Countryside Council for Wales) due to the reservoir's designation as a Site of Special Scientific Interest.

As a result, matters relating to access and the removal of the fencing will need to be addressed with both Celsa, as the current landowner, and Natural Resources Wales. However, the Leader will raise this matter, along with other issues with Celsa at a future meeting with company representatives.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Graham*

The Natural Resources Wales believe there is no public right of way to the reservoir; will the Council seek to challenge that assumption?

Reply: *County Councillor Bradbury*

You will have to forgive me, as the Leader is indisposed because of his interest, I will ask the Leader to write to you on that specific issue.

ENVIRONMENT QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Holden*

What current plans or proposals are currently being considered to build on parkland within the city limits?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

The Council is justifiably proud of its parkland heritage and is committed to protecting it for current and future generations of citizens.

The Council is continually involved in a process of reviewing its land holdings to ensure that the current use of any individual site is appropriate or whether an alternative use would be more beneficial.

This applies to the Council's whole estate and it is sensible that it should be involved in this process in order to ensure the most effective use of its assets.

Periodically, proposals are put forward for alternative uses involving an area or areas of open space and these are subject to rigorous consideration within the Council, and, of course, they would be open to full public scrutiny either when land is advertised for disposal or when proposals are subject to planning applications.

Please be assured that any development that would cause unacceptable harm to this heritage would not be supported.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Holden*

News has come to me that Llandaff Fields Community Trust have a plan in at the moment to build a large community facility on Llandaff Fields and I just wanted to ask whether or not that could be confirmed here in the Council Chamber tonight or whether that is an unsubstantiated rumour?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

What I can confirm is that from time to time development does take place on open land, just to quote an example where I live, opposite me the Rumney Recreation Field there, as I moved in the Eastern Leisure Centre was built - that has proved beneficial to the whole community and as I said any development that would cause unacceptable harm would be not be supported.

I cannot confirm anything around the potential development you are talking about there may be a number of applications in which my colleague will have to look at in his portfolio and obviously I would be involved in those discussions sometime in the future.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

The next time there are current plans or proposals to build on parkland within the cities limits will you undertake not to instruct officers to remove a full contribution from a local member to a full cabinet report.

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

The short answer is no, because it was my decision and I stick by that. The Cabinet however were, and did, have access to all the comments from all the Councillors involved and that is the important thing. The Cabinet made their decision on the full facts

#### EARLY YEARS, CHILDREN AND FAMILIES QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

Are there any proposals to alter opening hours at Grangetown Play Centre?

Reply: *County Councillor De'Ath*

The narrative contained in Line 255 of Appendix 5(b) of the 2014/15 Budget Report, as approved by Council on 28<sup>th</sup> February this year, stated clearly that:

*“All Play Centres to stay open, with savings being made through introducing shorter operating hours”*

So the answer is yes, there will be a reduction in opening hours at all play centres, not just in Grangetown.

The details are currently being worked up by officers and staff have been involved in this process. Any reduction will be kept to a minimum.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

I am stunned to hear that really, new Leader, new lead Cabinet Member, don't you think it is an absolute disgrace that in areas like Grangetown, where there are 100 kids playing yesterday enjoying themselves, looked after more importantly, don't you think it is absolute disgrace that just for £200,000 you are going to be closing these centres, not closing but reducing the hours where these kids can play in safety. Is it a disgrace or not?

Reply: *County Councillor De'Ath*

The details are still being worked out; we are involving staff, parents and the children going forward.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Lomax*

Would the Cabinet Member agree with me that Councillor McEvoy is breaking Council ward protocol by asking this question, I will look for your guidance on this?

Reply: *County Councillor De'Ath*

It does seem to me bad form, yes.



EDUCATION AND SKILLS QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Corria*

Mandatory training for school governors has recently been introduced by the local authority; however, it can be difficult for governors to attend the set dates and times. School governors have advised me that there is a significant gap between courses, which fill up quickly. Will the cabinet member consider providing training courses to school governors based on clusters of schools rather than centralised training at County Hall?

Reply: *County Councillor Magill*

Members will be aware that one of the important strategies included within the Education Development Plan is 'Improving School Governance'.

We want every Governing Body in Cardiff to be confident in their ability and knowledge so that they are more independent and are able to challenge and hold school leadership to account.

One of the ways in which the Council can help achieve this goal is through the provision of good training.

I am aware that a number of concerns have been raised by governors regarding the accessibility and availability of training.

I have asked officers to undertake a complete review of the governor training provision and to examine better ways to provide training, which will include more localised training for clusters of schools and alternative methods for training such as e-learning.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Bowden*

Councillor Magill, I think you are aware that I have been raising this issue, probably for months now, and as Chair of Governors at Birchgrove School I still have a number of Governors who are not able to get on to these training courses. They have until September 2014 to complete it for those who were previously, Governors prior to September 2013 when the Welsh Government brought this scheme in. When we have inspections

which this school will be having in the early New Year and Governors have not been able to attend these courses how is this going to reflect on the school when we have tried over and over again to get Governors on to training courses?

Reply: *County Councillor Magill*

I have just acknowledged that there have been problems and issues with the way this has been organised. I understand your frustration with this, I have certainly taken up the issues before in response to previous written communication from you and in response to a previous question to Full Council, it is a situation I will be monitoring very closely, I think in the circumstances it would seem to be a fair thing to do, to ask Governor Services to prioritise the training around the Governors of the school you are talking about in the context of an Estyn inspection coming up.

#### TRANSPORT, PLANNING AND SUSTAINABILITY QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Bowden*

At the meeting of Full Council in January 2014 councillors were informed by your predecessor, in response to a supplementary question from me in relation to what impact that the Gabalfa Interchange alterations had had on increases in cars using UHW as a short cut to avoid the queuing at the interchange, that there had been no adverse comments from UHW. It was clear in November 2013 from the correspondence that I was finally provided with in March 2014 that there was indeed both congestion at the interchange causing back up along the slip road, past the All Nations Centre to the UHW site; and that peak time 'rat running' had increased as road users were cutting through the UHW site (via both slip roads) to avoid the congestion at the interchange. This was having a severe impact on the traffic flow on the site and it was taking staff 45 minutes to exit the car park, and Cardiff Bus had complained about the impact the increase in traffic flow was having on its services.

Can you please explain why Councillors were told by the Cabinet Member that there had been no adverse comments from UHW when records show this not to be the case; and what do you intend to do about this?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

At the time when the question was asked my predecessor was clearly unaware of any adverse comments which had been received from officials at the University Hospital of Wales.

I have now been advised that, on 19 November 2013, officers received an email from a UHW representative expressing concern with regard to queuing past the All Nations Centre and “rat running” through the UHW site.

A prompt reply was provided by the Council explaining that the number of vehicles joining the Gabalfa Interchange on this westbound entry arm remained unchanged and that there was no survey data which showed that “rat running” through the UHW site had increased since the scheme was implemented.

The reply from UHW thanked officers for the feedback and confirmed that they would discuss the matter internally.

We have not received any further concerns from UHW. The scheme has now been completed and I am pleased that it appears to have been a success in respect of the primary aim of casualty reduction.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Bowden

I realise that it is quite difficult when you have to take over someone’s portfolio. I think it is really important that the Member did not know at that time about the survey or the concerns that had been raised. Could we therefore go back to UHW and definitively find out from them whether they are still experiencing problems and whether Cardiff Bus are still experiencing problems with their scheduling and their timetabling. I think that this is really important to us, as the local Councillors around the UHW site.

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I think what is important is that dialogue has already taken place with the hospital and they did say they would discuss the matter internally and if they had any concerns they would come back to us. They haven’t so really we have to leave it to them to do that. Obviously if those officials

from the HUW want to contact us they have got contact details of our officials and I would be more than happy to discuss it with them if need be.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Bridges*

I share Councillor Bowden's view that obviously this is not your decision, this is old ground and you are now responsible for it. There is not a lot of sense in going through what we already know, a lot of way this was handled was a shambles in terms of consultation with the public, consultation with Members and we are now hearing in consultation with UHW what I think Members will want reassurance over is about the situation from now on and how we tackle things in future. In particular in relation to the south side of the Gabalfa interchange where no final plans have been agreed for the Whitchurch Road exit and how we perhaps reorganise that so I would ask for some assurance from you that you will speak with officers as a matter of urgency about that issue, bring yourself up to speed about it as it is a new portfolio for you and that you engage with Members at an early stage to seek their thoughts. I would just ask for your reassurance.

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I think what is important before the actual junction was done there was approximately 10 injuries per year and since August 2013, which is 9 months ago, there has been one slight injury so clearly there is some evidence to say that the actual junction is working and also the 20 mph speed limit has been endorsed by South Wales Police so these are all positive things but certainly if there are concerns, any concerns the Members have or anyone else, they need to be brought to our attention but do remember that at that time the Leader of your group had actually endorsed the changes to this area who had said she sees it as a positive. We do need to see it as a positive; we might have had problems in the past, I accept those, but what we have got to do move forward and obviously if you have any concerns to bring it forward to us.

Point of Explanation: *County Councillor Bridges*

I do think it is worth putting a slight marker on that and just saying that both myself and the Leader of my group, our issue was not so much about the principle of the scheme, it wasn't even about some of the detail that

was done, it was about the manner in which it was conducted and I just think it is important to state that given what you have said because it wasn't ever that we were opposing particular elements of the scheme it was about the manner in which it was done and that is what we want to sort out.

HEALTH, HOUSING AND WELLBEING QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Woodman*

Recently, a number of appeals against the under occupancy rule have been won by individuals because the bedroom is so small it cannot be classed as a bedroom. Could you please advise how many council owned properties have bedrooms below the required size to be officially classed as a bedroom, and as a result how many tenants have been affected by the under occupancy rule incorrectly?

If this is not yet known, when will a review be done to identify those affected?

Also, how much of the money provided by Government to help with Discretionary Housing Payment for 2013/14 has not been spent during the year 2013/14?

Reply: *County Councillor Elsmore*

Cardiff's Housing Service has procedures in place for reviewing room sizes. Indeed, this procedure was implemented before the introduction of the Under Occupancy rule. The size of a number of properties was re-designated as part of requirements to meet the Welsh Housing Quality Standard.

As a result, not a single property has been re-designated due to bedroom-size since April 2013. 4 cases were identified of incorrect recording and appropriate adjustments made.

Cardiff's grant for Discretionary Housing Payment in 2013/14 amounted to £1.1 million. Following successful bids to the DWP and Welsh Government this grant was increased to £1.4 million.

Despite allocation challenges, due to late receipt of these additional funds, I am pleased to report that in Cardiff none of the Discretionary Housing Payment will be paid back to the DWP or Welsh Government. Indeed, all funds have been paid to those who need them.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Woodman*

I am pleased to hear that we won't be paying back any discretionary housing payment. For this current year can I ask the Cabinet Member to send me an email just to verify that the way the awards for discretionary housing payment have been made for in the past year will continue and if there has been a change can I be advised of those changes.

Reply: *County Councillor Elsmore*

Absolutely Councillor Woodman I am very happy to keep you fully informed.

#### TRANSPORT, PLANNING AND SUSTAINABILITY QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Walker*

Your cabinet predecessor made welcome undertakings to me (and by implication to other councillors affected by the LDP) that he would facilitate close consultation with community representatives at the LDP master planning stage. This would enable communities affected to express and explore preferences and needs prior to the formal planning process. Will the cabinet member honour this commitment in the spirit of localism and support the involvement of communities in key decisions which affect them before they become firm proposals?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

The LDP has now been subject to six formal stages of consultation and engagement in full accordance with the Delivery Agreement.

Additionally, a further engagement process specifically addressing master planning issues took place in March 2013. This addressed general principles as well as site-specific matters and was over-and-above the commitments made in the Delivery Agreement.

This clearly demonstrates a high level of community involvement in the preparation of all stages of the LDP.

The LDP is programmed to be submitted to the Welsh Government for independent examination in August this year following a meeting of the Council in June. This will provide a further opportunity for the views of residents to be independently considered.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Walker*

I think I understood you to agree to what I have asked for in the question Ramesh, thank you for that we welcome the continuation of the approach that Councillor Hinchey took previously.

The only supplementary from me would be would you please ask the Officers to be proactive to those of us who are involved in the LDP, not just to myself but my other colleagues from other parties to offer this consultation before it gets to master planning stage that is the key thing because often we are caught by a planning application being bundled up and by that stage, as you well know, it is far too late to do anything.

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

The LDP is to the benefit for the whole of Cardiff and I would certainly welcome the officers engaging with all the Members as early as possible and obviously to try and make the thing go forward so I would support that.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

I am just wondering whether or not the Councillor approves of the referendum or referenda, as it will be - there will be a lot more, as a way of consulting with the public?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I don't think it would be appropriate to talk about referendums when it hasn't happened and we would have to look at the results of those referendums.

QUESTION TO THE LEADER (ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND PARTNERSHIPS)

Question: *County Councillor Cowan*

Are there any plans to revert back to previous arrangements, pre 2012, where the Lord Mayor and Deputy Lord Mayor have a formal installation ceremony in the Marble Hall?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

There are no plans to revert back to previous arrangements for a formal installation ceremony.

We want to move forward in supporting the Lord Mayor to uphold the democratic values of this Council and to promote good governance and active citizenship.

There will be better opportunities in the Council calendar over the next year to do this than to do it through in an outdated and no doubt costly formal installation ceremony.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Cowan*

My question last month regarding the splitting of the Mayoralty was whether or not we would be having a Presiding Member and a Lord Mayor. Looking at the comments that you have given us back today can I take the comments that you would be supportive of splitting the role?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

My reply is no different from the one that I gave you before in that we do need to wait for the report from the Constitution Committee on that issue and when that report is ready then an appropriate decision will be made at that time.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Walker*

Just to express the hope that you will consider this suggestion favourably because those of who experienced this process in the past, I think found



it, that the May meeting had a purpose by having the inauguration of the Lord Mayor following that meeting and in fact it made it a very enjoyable, important and significant occasion whereas in recent times it hasn't happening. I hope in due course you will give this consideration Leader because I think it would enhance this Council's prestige and the prestige of the Lord Mayor.

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

There is of course nothing to stop the new Lord Mayor and Deputy Lord Mayor from doing an event themselves. I think that in light of the difficult challenges we face there was a substantial cost associated with that ceremony in the past and I think we need to be mindful of that when we are making some very difficult decisions ahead although I do of course take on board the comments and I am happy to reflect on that point.

#### ENVIRONMENT QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Corria*

Will the cabinet member consider returning community sweepers to our wards?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

You will be aware that, as part of the new 'needs based service' that was approved by Cabinet in December last year; the Community Sweepers were re-integrated within the transit vehicle-based operative teams. This allows for a more flexible and responsive resource deployment and enables resources to be focused efficiently on those areas that require the most cleaning.

The implementation of the new approach commenced in January and the bedding-in process is still ongoing. With any such significant operational change, we may need to make some subsequent adjustments to the deployment of resources going forward in the light of operational experiences and stakeholder feedback. This work will also link to the new Litter Bin Policy agreed by Cabinet last week, which will assist in improving the provision and location of litter bins within communities.

In the current economic climate, with ongoing pressures to reduce resources and improve operational efficiencies, I do not intend to reduce operational flexibility by re-introducing Community Sweepers in this financial year. However, if there any other particular streets in your ward that are causing you particular concern in terms of cleanliness, then please let me know and I will arrange for these to be promptly inspected.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Corria*

I appreciate that we need to focus resources in certain areas, but I did witness recently on a Friday evening, a mechanical sweeper going up and down, up and down, up and down Queen Street, and I could have eaten my dinner if it the same spot was so clean. I would actually like to invite you, if possible, to Llandaff North because I think that there are streets in my Ward, particularly Station Road where I do live, that have a number of takeaways, we have a lot of schools in that areas, we have lot of shops. We would very much appreciate some of the focused resources in Llandaff North.

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

Thank you councillor Corria for the invite I would be delighted to attend the greater kingdom of Llandaff North in your company as long as you are able to protect me from people throwing litter at me as I get there.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Craig Williams*

I would like to echo the calls for reinstatement at Llandaff North but would remind the Cabinet Member that there are also other areas of the City which are without community sweepers and in this spirit of cooperative Council or as you might call it more appropriately the big society Council, I would argue that our community sweepers in some of the more rural and urban wards actually prove financially viable in the sense that they were a lot more than community sweepers, they are actually community leaders and it is in terms of the educational aspect I don't think you can compare them straight in a budget line against other methods of looking and dealing with litter, both in enforcement and dealing with it. I would like you to rethink that and I more than happy to meet with you and explain what the community sweeper delivered in my ward and what she actually prevented in my ward coming into your

budget now otherwise I am more than happy to give out C2C's number to everyone in my ward and say any piece of litter you find ring this number and you will soon find a massive cost associated with that.

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

I am just amazed that people in your Ward drop litter; it is something that I did not realise that happened in your fair part of the city, what I would say is that if you are able to provide me with the savings that we managed to get from reducing the community sweepers then I would be more than happy to take that on board, however, I am as aware as you, I am a local councillor too believe or not, I did have a community sweeper in my ward and I was also very sorry to lose them however, financial restraints and I won't say whose fault they are because we all know have made sure that we have had to make some unpleasant and unpalatable decisions and this was one of them.

#### TRANSPORT, PLANNING AND SUSTAINABILITY QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Bridges*

There is a backlog of applications to buy/renew parking permits as a result of the Labour council's decision to get rid of the permit office at County Hall and instead process applications by post. Furthermore, despite the delay resident's face in getting their permits, the date of the permit is set from when they sent the application and not when the permit is printed - meaning residents are often paying for weeks and months of parking without being able to use it!

What will you do about the backlog, when will the online system we were promised be up and running, and what will you do about the unfair system whereby permits start from the date of application receipt rather than the date of issue?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I can confirm that there is currently no backlog of applications and permits are currently being despatched on the next working day. Hence your claim that residents are paying for parking time without being able to use it is not correct.

In addition, the date of the permit is not, as you claim, set from the time they send their application.

Permits are always dated to expire at the end of the month of application plus one year. So a person applying today in April 2014 will receive a permit valid until 30<sup>th</sup> April 2015.

We remain committed to providing an online application and payment facility and the required software is currently being developed by the Council's ICT team so that it can be integrated with the Council's new website. The current estimated date for completion is by the end of June.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Bridges*

I am going on the information I was given by a resident and I have no reason to dispute what they are telling me so it sounds as though there has been an issue and I hope that it's been resolved and from what you are saying it sounds as though it may have been.

I do remain concerned about the amount of time that it has taken for the online system to come into place, I know from my own experience that the time it takes for a permit to be issued is longer than used to be the case under the old system and it does seem to be a backwards step. Will you give a reassurance to Council that you will, through your regular cabinet statements, provide updates on the online system so that we can actually tell our residents when the new system will be in place and give them some reassurance on that?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I will certainly be speaking to the Officers and to encourage them to keep as many people updated with the system as well.

TRANSPORT, PLANNING AND SUSTAINABILITY QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Merry*

As the new cabinet member for planning what plans does Councillor Patel have to lobby the Welsh Assembly for a change in the planning

laws governing HMOs and how will he work with other local authorities with an interest in changing the planning rules?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I recognise that the current legislation in Wales differs from that in England, particularly where 7 or more persons residing in a property may be deemed to constitute a HMO. In England, that threshold has been reduced to 4 or more.

I intend to engage with other Local Planning Authorities in Wales where this is a live issue with the intention of lobbying Welsh Government to change the legislation.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Merry*

Swansea Council has published a document on the impact on HMO's in parts of Swansea. Could Cardiff to a similar piece of research to provide an evidence base to use when lobbying WAG and to underpin our planning policy?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

It is always important to use good practice wherever possible and I am aware that Swansea Council has undertaken an impact assessment of HMOs in areas of its city with a view to lobbying the Welsh Government.

It is a corporate objective of this Council to similarly assess HMO impacts in key parts of the city in order to lobby Welsh Government directly and I will ask officers to examine the best practice arising from work that has been undertaken in Swansea.

## ENVIRONMENT QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Chaundy*

In view of the declining number of pollinating insects, would Cabinet please assist in reducing this decline by introducing low-growing wildflower meadow plants along our many highway verges to provide nectar and pollen for the bees and bugs?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

The Council is currently looking to support a strategy to help with pollinating insects and wild flower areas within the city. This includes the planting of flower-rich, pollinator friendly mixes of plants that have a bold impact and native wildflower meadows which provide valuable habitat.

This planting programme will be trialled at 27 sites across the city within parks, open spaces and cemeteries, some of which will have been planted previously. These include new sites being brought in this year, including Pontcanna Fields, Cemetery Park, Hailey Park and Heath Park. Previously work has been carried out on a number of areas, such as Bute Park, Roath Park, Cardiff Bay Wetlands, Greenway Road and the Danescourt Roundabout.

I am currently working with officers on creating hierarchies and changed maintenance regimes across all of our green spaces, including roadside verges. The aim of this is to reduce the cost of maintenance whilst promoting enhanced biodiversity. As the Councillor knows from our trip to the Bee World presentation I am as passionate as he is to get this moving forward and I want to see a lot more of it.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Gordon*

Councillor Derbyshire you missed out one wild flower meadow which was created last year in Pontcanna fields, which is a field adjacent to the allotments and this year they are not going to mow that field and they did plant, the Parks Department, did plant lovely meadow flowers. I just want to return to the question that was asked earlier on. How safe are our fields from development, in particular, the Llandaff Community Trust and its partnership with the Cardiff Metropolitan University which appear to be threatening to take over land in Llandaff Fields.

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

I cannot comment unfortunately on your second point, but in terms of Pontcanna fields perhaps I spoke a bit too quickly because I was keen to get everything in, but I did mention Pontcanna fields as one of the areas

where we had been doing the planting and I am very pleased that we are doing.

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT, CO-OPERATIVES AND SOCIAL ENTERPRISE QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Parry*

Will the Council be closing the Department of Local Studies at Cardiff Central Library and, if so, what are the plans for its future?

Reply: *County Councillor Bradbury*

I can confirm that the Local Studies Department is not being closed, but will be moved to the Local Studies & Libraries Support Service Unit in Dominions Way. This is situated just off Newport Road, less than two miles from the city centre, and is on several major bus routes.

The excellent collection of books, maps, newspapers etc. will continue to be accessible to all Cardiff citizens in the on-site public reading room, along with the other useful source materials that are also stored there.

The only materials to be relocated elsewhere will be the collection of manuscripts which are currently held in the Central Library and we are currently in discussion with the Glamorgan Archives about transferring them to their facility in Leckwith.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Parry*

Could this Council please make sure that whatever we do or where ever we decide to site this much used Department of Local Studies the people who use this service will be informed beforehand please?

Reply: *County Councillor Bradbury*

We as a Council, in a decision to move anything, aim to inform service users first and have a robust consultation period, so I think I can confidently say yes to that question.

CORPORATE SERVICES AND PERFORMANCE QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Parry*

What line does this Council take on Zero Hour Contracts?

Who benefits from these contracts?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

'Zero hours contracts' do not have any legal definition and cover a range of different employment arrangements.

In the light of ongoing media interest surrounding 'zero hours contracts', guidance on their use, benefits, problems and alternative approaches has been agreed jointly with Trade Unions at the Joint Council for Wales meeting held earlier this month.

This guidance has been commended to all councils in Wales and we will ensure that it is reflected in our employment arrangements.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Parry*

I don't really know how to take that. I know that you mean well and that the Unions mean well because they are for the people but we are for the people as well.

We live in a time of austerity when jobs are like gold dust, thousands of Cardiff citizens, they have no real home of their own and now zero hours contacts for hundreds of people who have bills to pay. We seem to have gone back 100 years.

I know that everyone in this Council Chamber, I think, are worried about this and a lot of people outside are worried about this, because who can afford to be paid this week but not next week, but I understand what you are saying.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor McKerlich*

Given the shortage of statements from Cabinet Members this month and in previous months would it be reasonable to conclude that many of your



colleagues are benefiting from zero hours contracts, and they are benefiting at the expense of democratic accountability.

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I am not quite sure if there is a question in there, but the point is noted and I am sure my colleagues will be coming forward with statements thick and fast in the months ahead.

### ENVIRONMENT QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Gordon*

When the most popular and well used centrally located Waungron Road recycling centre closes at the end of April, how is the Council going to direct people to the Bessemer Road site in the heart of an industrial wasteland?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

There will be communications through signage and the local media. Signs have already been placed on site.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Gordon*

That was a bit short. The important thing is that Hadfield Road is the main road that you need to be signposting people too and at the moment on Bessemer Close, which is the little side street off Hadfield Road you have to take to get to the recycling centre that we will all have to use, there is no sign at the moment there whatsoever to say that the recycling centre is down there and I think on all your publicity I want to ask you please could you keep saying Hadfield Road which people do know and will be able to find, and when you get to Hadfield Road there is some very obvious huge sign that says recycling centre down there, can you do that?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

My answer was short because that was all I had to say about the issue. However if you feel there are still some issues around people actually not

being able to work out where they are going I am happy for you to contact me outside of the Chamber and we can look at what you are suggesting with officers to see if we need to improve the signage.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

The answer to this and other questions show that we have had a change of guard but no change of policy. Could you tell us what your personal priorities are for your portfolio area please?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

That is very simple; my personal priorities are to make sure that within the budget process we are able to deliver our Labour manifesto commitments.

Point of Information: *County Councillor Huw Thomas*

I am sure that my colleague's in Grangetown would appreciate me making as point of information to Council that the area around Bessemer Road is not in fact an industrial waste land it is an area where quite a lot of commercial activity does take place and I would encourage people to go there and partake in that commercial activity.

#### CORPORATE SERVICES AND PERFORMANCE QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Mitchell*

Will the cabinet member comment on the cost to the council and the community that could be associated with recent single issue campaigns in Fairwater?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

You will be aware that the Community Meeting that was held in Fairwater on 7 April 2014 demanded a Community Poll concerning the Deposit Local Development Plan.

I can confirm that the estimated costs to the Council, which are attributable directly to the running of the Community Poll in Fairwater on 30 April 2014, will be £3,460.47.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Mitchell*

I have got nothing against the referendum obviously, but when you compare this cost, if it's carried out across the city and you compare it to the, for example, the £200,000 quoted for the Youth Service, it's a comparable sum of money for very little outcome.

My supplementary question is this: given that this campaign has now caused housing market difficulties in the north of the Ward by naming streets affected by an alleged proposal the Council has already written to estate agents and residents assuring them of the true facts, can you then assure me that the Council will maintain a duty of care to those who have been affected by this campaign by seeing their house sales collapse and their potential house values reduced to try and recover some of that housing market confidence as much as possible?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I have been advised that Officers are monitoring the situation to ensure that all relevant codes and protocols are being followed in this instance.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

I think we are talking blight and I think look no further than the Local Development Plan. All you have to do to remove - and this is what it says in the document - 'the proposed measures' okay 'the proposed measures'. Withdraw those proposed measures in June and there is no blight. Do you agree?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

As the Member will well know that the process that is in place is a statutory one for the Local Development Plan and we will follow that accordingly so that we get an LDP that is no longer a deposit one but is actually an approved Local Development Plan that is sound according to the independent inspector.

QUESTION TO THE LEADER (ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND PARTNERSHIPS)

Question: *County Councillor Love*

Will the leader comment on the future of Cardiff's tourism strategy?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I have in fact instigated work to refresh and update the Cardiff Tourism Strategy. Officers from our Tourism team are currently undertaking preparatory work on this with a view to consulting with stakeholders later in the year as part of our wider discussions around the Cardiff Convention.

Tourism is undoubtedly a major part of the Cardiff and wider city-regional economy and it is essential that we maximise the impact that tourism can have on supporting the local economy and our local communities.

Engaging with those who work in, and benefit from the sector is essential if we are to make the most of our city's fantastic assets. Once these discussions have been concluded, we will look to launch a strategy towards the end of the year.

The Cardiff Business Council will play a key role in helping to shape the new strategy and the fact that tourism is now integrated within the wider Economic Development Directorate, of which I have responsibility, will ensure that a more coordinated approach to working with our partners.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Love*

I just wanted to request whether within that strategy we could develop partnerships, what partnerships can be developed to ensure that when international tourists from all over the world arrive in London they are encouraged to make the 2 hour trip over to Cardiff and experience the heritage, beauty and culture of Cardiff City and beyond?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I agree with the Member that we need to maximise the opportunities for the international tourist market to Cardiff and obviously the electrification of the main line from London to Cardiff will make us even closer so we need to make sure that we get that message across and I hope that you and other Members will engage in the consultation over a future tourism strategy and feed into that process.

Councillor Craig Williams

I also share the Leaders delight at the electrification of that railway and all opportunities it presents to our great city but I do want to ask specifically about the tourism strategy. When Cardiff & Co and the sub organisations surrounding that were wound up this council was promised a tourism strategy and a tourism opportunity development offer pretty swiftly after. We are still waiting and we are still talking about strategies now. While we sit in an office talking about strategies, our competitors like Bristol are offering a vision and a tourism opportunity.

Will the Leader realise the great urgency in getting on with this now and not just developing strategies?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I think you will appreciate that I have only been in post for 3 weeks and I have already noted the importance of the tourism strategy, it's in my portfolio, I think with the Cardiff Convention later on in the year there is a real opportunity to look at best practice across, not just Britain but wider and I think we do need to refresh that strategy, we do need to take opportunities where they exist and also look at our major projects like the Convention Centre to see that we are, where possible, driving forward a strategy which maximises those opportunities, not just for Cardiff as well but for the wider region.

#### 190: APPOINTMENT OF LOCAL AUTHORITY GOVERNORS TO SCHOOL GOVERNING BODIES.

The Council was recommended to approve the appointment of Local Authority School Governors as listed on the amendment sheet.

**RESOLVED:** That the following appointments of School Governors be approved:

<u>School</u>	<u>Ward</u>	<u>Start of Vacancy</u>	<u>Applications</u>
Whitchurch High (Foundation)	Whitchurch	19/09/2013	Dr M J Newman
Willows High	Splott	15/01/2014	Councillor Manzor Ahmed
Ninian Park Primary	Grangetown	25/09/2013	Mr M Edwards
Ton Yr Ywen Primary	Heath	26/01/2014	Mr C Martin
Whitchurch Primary	Whitchurch	22/01/2014	Dr A Pilgrim

#### 191: NOTICE OF MOTION

The Lord Mayor advised there was one Notice of Motion.

The following Notice of Motion was moved by Councillor Holden and seconded by Councillor Sanders.

This Council notes that research has proven that those people who garden have better mental and physical health and as such are less likely to draw on care services.

This Council also notes that as part of its statutory duty it has an obligation to provide allotment and leisure gardens.

This Council further notes that the allotments are largely run on the good will of volunteer site secretaries and their committees and that without this good will the Council could not meet its statutory obligation to provide allotment space to the general population.

This council therefore calls for the relevant Cabinet Member to organise to meet with volunteer site secretaries, their committees and their representative organisation (CAHA) collectively, in an open meeting, to agree a new allotment strategy going forward.

This council further agrees to give serious thought and consideration to any suggestions that arise from said discussions.

RESOLVED: As a result of information provided by Councillor Derbyshire and a point of order being raised by Councillor Holden, a vote was taken and the Motion was carried.

#### 192: URGENT BUSINESS

In accordance with the pilot Council Procedure Rule 3(xv) the Lord Mayor advised that he had not been notified of any urgent matters for this meeting.

#### 193: APPOINTMENT OF CHAIR AND NOMINATIONS TO COUNCIL COMMITTEES AND PANEL

The Council at its Annual Meeting on 23 May 2013 elected the Chairs and Deputy Chairs (where appropriate) of Committees established by the Council; and received and approved nominations from political groups to the seats allocated on each Committee.

RESOLVED: The Council AGREED the following nominations to vacancies on Committees.

Councillor David Groves – Community and Adult Scrutiny Committee  
Councillor Chris Lomax – Democratic Services Committee  
Councillor David Groves – Chairperson – Community and Adult Scrutiny Committee

#### 194: NOMINATIONS OF MEMBERS TO SERVE ON OUTSIDE BODIES

The Constitution provides that the Council will, from time to time, receive nominations and make Member appointments as necessary to serve as representatives of the Council on outside bodies.

RESOLVED: The Council AGREED the following nominations to serve on Outside Bodies:

Arts Council for Wales(South	Councillor Bradbury
------------------------------	---------------------

Wales Area Committee)	
Business in Focus	Councillor Bradbury
Capital Region Tourism	Councillor Bale
Cardiff & Vale College Corporation	Councillor Magill
Cardiff & Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund – Investment Advisory Panel	Councillor Hinchey
Cardiff Airport Consultative Committee	Councillor Patel
Cardiff Bay Advisory Committee	Councillor Derbyshire Councillor Bradbury
Cardiff Business Technology Centre	Councillor Bale
Cardiff Sportlot Community Chest	Councillor Bradbury
Care & Repair Cardiff	Councillor Elsmore
Consortium of Local Authorities in Wales	Councillor Hinchey
Flood Risk Management – South East Area Environment Group	Councillor Patel
Integrated Health & Social Care Programme Board	Councillor De’Ath Councillor Elsmore
Joint Council for Wales	Councillor Hinchey
Local Government Association General Assembly	Councillor Bale
Millennium Stadium PLC	Councillor Bale
Minerals Regional Technical Statement – Member Steering Group	Councillor Patel
National Society for Clean Air	Councillor Patel
Norwegian Church Advisory Committee	Councillor Bradbury
PATROL – Parking and Traffic Regulations Outside London	National Group - Councillor Patel Wales Group – Councillor Patel
Prosiect Gwyrdd Joint Committee	Councillor Hinchey Councillor Derbyshire
Race Equality First	Councillor Bradbury
Sherman Cymru	Councillor Bradbury



South East Wales Regional Waste Group	Councillor Derbyshire
South East Wales Strategic Planning Group (SEWSPG)	Councillor Patel
Standing Advisory Council for Religious Education (SACRE)	Councillor Magill
Wales Migration Partnership	Councillor Bradbury
Welsh Joint Education Committee (WJEC)	Councillor Magill
Welsh Purchasing Consortium	Councillor Hinchey
WLGA Co-ordinating Committee	Councillor Bale
WLGA Council	Councillor Bale Councillor Cook Councillor De'Ath Councillor Elsmore Councillor Hinchey Councillor Magill Councillor Patel

*(Formal Meeting closed at 6.45pm)*

In accordance with pilot Council Procedure Rule 17 (f) the following Written Questions were received for considerations and response ahead of this meeting. A full copy of all written questions together with the answers were circulated to Members by email and published on the website in advance of the Council meeting and are included as a record in the minutes of the meeting.

#### 195: WRITTEN QUESTIONS

#### **CITIZEN & COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT AND DEMOCRACY**

W1	<p><b><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES</u></b></p> <p>What is the annual cost of maintaining the Member Dictation Bank?</p>
----	---

What is the cost in terms of officer time for providing the service?

How many Members have used the service in the last year?

**Reply**

In the 2013/14 financial year, Democratic Services dealt with 1,364 dictations.

Use of the dictation service varies widely across the membership of the Council. Only 19 Members made use of the service during this period; with 85% of all dictations coming from the four most frequent users.

The "Dictabank" facility incurs an annual maintenance contract which currently costs £1,950 per annum. The officer time incurred is not specifically recorded; however, it can safely be said that it occupies less than one full time equivalent role.

Savings have been taken from this area of Democratic Services in the current financial year. In addition, it is hoped that increased provision of technology to Members will reduce the demand placed on this service in the future.

**COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT, CO-OPERATIVES AND SOCIAL ENTERPRISE**

W2

**WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOWDEN**

How would you explain to the former members of the Birchgrove Bowling Club, that was forced to close at the end of last season, that their green has been now been offered another bowling club?

**Reply**

You will be aware that, against the backdrop of unprecedented financial challenges, this administration has had to take some very difficult decisions following election in May 2012. Allied to this, you will also be aware that municipal bowls provision, which is a non statutory service, is currently heavily subsidised by the Council.

The Council has been working with a number of bowling clubs, including the Birchgrove Bowling Club; over the past 14 months in order to identify and arrive upon solutions that sustain provision and eliminate the high levels of subsidy that currently exist. Included within options considered by the club and Council have been Community Asset Transfer and the buying back of the Council's bowling green maintenance service.

Following a number of meetings spanning a number of months, the Birchgrove Bowling Club reached a decision not to pursue either of the options above as, owing to the low membership, neither option was deemed as sustainable.

Notwithstanding the decision reached by the Birchgrove Bowling Club and owing to the declining condition of the built facilities at the Maindy Bowls site, the resident bowling club at the Maindy site, St. Josephs, have reached a decision to switch their home venue/base to the Llwynfedw Gardens site. This arrangement will see St. Josephs accessing the buy-back service for green maintenance.

You may be aware that, as a result of these developments, the bowling club's Ladies section will continue to play at the Llwynfedw Gardens site for the forthcoming season and an opportunity exists for members of the Mens section to utilise the green by joining the St.

Josephs Club.

In view of this explanation, it can be evidenced that it is far from the case that the Birchgrove Bowling Club has been forced to close. Indeed, to the contrary, the Council has made every effort to ensure provision is sustained and an opportunity currently exists for Birchgrove Bowling Club members to play bowls at the Llwynfedw Gardens site. Given the measures taken by the Council and working with the clubs in question, provision will continue on site without subsidy to the council tax payer.

### **CORPORATE SERVICES AND PERFORMANCE**

W3

#### **WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOWDEN**

Was an Equality Impact Assessment (EqIA) undertaken on the Council's procedure for consulting with its residents on the 2014/15 Budget?

If so, how did you ensure that the most marginalised of our residents were consulted within the 2 week time frame (other than by the on-line survey) including, for example, the elderly whose meals on wheels will be going up; the disabled who rely on the city centre buggies; the children and those they care for as young carers about the removal of funding for Young carers programme; the poorer and marginalised communities within our city whose play centres were to close; and those for whom English is a second language or who lack literacy?

#### **Reply**

The 2014/15 budget consultation exercise involved a number of equality impact assessments of each of the Directorate budget proposals so that the potential impact on the different protected characteristics could be determined.

All Directorates undertook screenings for each proposal and then completed full equality impact assessments where required. As part of this, they would have needed to take into consideration the impact on their service users, including consulting directly with them should

	<p>there be a proposed change to the service provided.</p> <p>The individual Directorate assessments are available on the Council's website and will be able to provide you with details of what engagement there has been or is planned where the detailed proposals were still to be worked through.</p>
W4	<p><b><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES</u></b></p> <p>I welcome the Leader's initiative to rationalise the space on the top floor of County Hall so that Cabinet Members and their support staff use the space more effectively. Rehousing more officers into County Hall continues the policy, started by the last administration, of reducing the number of buildings Cardiff Council has in the city, and saving the taxpayer money – and I welcome the Cabinet's decision to 'share the pain' in this regard. Will you undertake to carry out a similar process on Level 2 of County Hall?</p> <p>Currently we have individual offices for each scrutiny Chair, many of which go unused throughout much of the week, and a corridor of offices by Committee Room 4 which are rarely used; some group rooms are also under-utilised. If some of this space were made into a 'hot desking' area for Members, along with a few small, private, bookable meeting spaces and some limited storage area, I am sure that it would free up further room for officers who need to be based in County Hall full-time.</p> <p><b><u>Reply</u></b></p> <p>The Council's Office Rationalisation project aims to reduce the number of council premises and to use existing office floor space more effectively. It has not only modernised the office environment, but has also delivered significant revenue savings for the Council.</p> <p>I can confirm that the Leader has already asked officers to review the existing accommodation and facilities for Members on Level 2 of County Hall and also at City Hall. This may involve an investment however and any scheme would need to have a coherent business case, in terms of either releasing space for staff or associated revenue savings. The recommendations arising from this exercise</p>

will be subject to consultation with Members in due course.
---

**EDUCATION AND SKILLS**

W5

**WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOWDEN**

How would you explain to parents of children in schools whose budgets have been cut significantly because they have low numbers of pupils in receipt of Free School Meals and which will lead to staff redundancies at the same time as targets still have to be met with fewer resources?

**Reply**

School Governing Bodies are responsible for managing their delegated budgets and a key element of the formula funding for schools is pupil numbers. Despite the administration's commitment to investment in education, circumstances will arise where a governing body has to review staff numbers in light of its budget.

This year's budget process has been extremely difficult with the Council having to make savings of approximately £50m which has had a significant impact on a number of services.

Schools delegated budgets were protected from making general savings and the Council met the Welsh Government target of increasing school delegated budgets by at least 0.90%.

In addition to this the Welsh Government Pupil Deprivation Grant has been doubled for the 2014/15 financial year to £918 per pupil. This will mean that the total received by Cardiff schools will increase from £3.9 million to over £8 million. Most schools will receive more funding through this grant in this financial year. Those schools with a high proportion of pupils eligible to receive a free school meal will receive significantly more.

Whilst overall there has been an increase in resources available to schools the impact of increasing costs has meant that some schools will have to make adjustments to their spending plans. In some cases, particularly in a number of Secondary schools, where overall

	<p>pupil numbers continue to decrease, this will mean having to reduce staffing numbers.</p> <p>Officers continue to work with those schools that are facing a budget deficit.</p>
W6	<p><b><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOWDEN</u></b></p> <p>The recent invitation to governors to encourage them to attend the Staff Redeployment and Redundancy training in view of the Budget decisions appeared to undermine the Administration's commitment to investment in education within Cardiff. Could you explain this please?</p> <p><b><u>Reply</u></b></p> <p>School Governing Bodies are responsible for managing their delegated budgets and a key element of the formula funding for schools is pupil numbers. Despite the administration's commitment to investment in education, circumstances will arise where a governing body has to review staff numbers in light of its budget.</p> <p>The Council's Redeployment and Redundancy Policy for Schools assists governing bodies in achieving staff reductions through agreed procedures. Governor training is provided by HR People Services as part of its support to governing bodies and the purpose of the recent reminder was to encourage governors to attend.</p>
W7	<p><b><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOYLE</u></b></p> <p>In relation to the 'Thinking Through Autism' self-reflection framework,</p> <p>a) how many schools have embedded the framework into their day-to-day working?</p> <p>b) what involvement has the cabinet member had in ensuring the framework has been adopted by as many schools as possible?</p> <p><b><u>Reply</u></b></p> <p>The 'Thinking Through Autism' framework is an innovative and</p>

unique tool, produced by the Autism Support Team (AST) and specialists in autism from across our Cardiff Autism Spectrum Disorder (ASD) provisions.

The framework can be used by schools as a self-audit tool to highlight existing good practice and to improve teaching and learning within the school setting. Its use will contribute to consistency of practice within and across our schools. The focus of the framework is meeting the needs of our learners on the autism spectrum, but we are confident that using the framework will enhance teaching practice and learning experiences for all children.

The team has devised a support and training package to assist schools to use the framework effectively. We introduced the framework to all Cardiff SENCos / ALNCos at their forum meetings last year and invited them to engage with us in improving practice. So far one high school, one primary school and one SEN school have completed the process of using the framework, with a further six schools actively engaged at present; two of which are Welsh Medium.

This Administration will continue to promote the document and raise its profile within schools. The autism framework is the first of its kind produced in Wales and we are keen to ensure that it fulfils its potential as a tool for enhancing practice in schools. We are proud that Cardiff is leading practice in autism for Wales.

## **ENVIRONMENT**

W8

### **WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOWDEN**

What is proposed for the Parks buildings in Heath Park once staff have relocated?

#### **Reply**

The Parks Service, which formerly operated from the property in Heath Park, has relocated to alternative premises and has declared the property surplus to its operational requirements.



	<p>As a result of the move, the property has been reviewed by the Council's Asset Management Board and no alternative use for the property within the Authority has been identified.</p> <p>Through the Public Services Leadership Group's National Assets Working Group Land Transfer Protocol, the Council has received interest from Cardiff University in the potential purchase of the office property and, as a result, has opened discussions with the University about a possible disposal.</p>
W9	<p><b><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOWDEN</u></b></p> <p>With reference to the Corporate Plan 2014/15 what kind of partnering do you anticipate entering into with third sector, public, private and commercial organisations to ensure continued operation of the city's parks?</p> <p>Will these result in more leases of council owned land?</p> <p><b><u>Reply</u></b></p> <p>There are many good examples of where involvement and contributions from the third sector, private sector and commercial organisations benefit and add value to our parks offer, which include:</p> <p>The hosting of the Royal Horticultural Society Show Cardiff which 'kicks off' the Society's prestigious calendar of flower shows and plays an important role in terms of impact of the local business environment from an economic perspective.</p> <p>The engagement of concessionaires for parks facilities such as the Summerhouse Kiosk, Secret Garden Café and Pettigrew Tea Rooms in Bute Park that serve to enhance the user experience and provide a valuable income stream for the park.</p> <p>The city-wide network of volunteers and constituted Friends Groups that work with the Council to improve the local environment, having the ability to access funding streams not available to the Council.</p>

	<p>The Council will build on the foundations laid to date and will seek to secure a broader range of partnerships for its services and facilities which may include Community Asset Transfer and/or social enterprises for the provision of outdoor sport and recreational facilities, the development of local management agreements for public open space and the alternative use of parks building assets in order to secure investment and improved facilities.</p> <p>It must be recognised that in order to form partnerships that secure investment, improve services and sustain provision security of tenure is key. This may not, however, result in a lease agreements being granted in all instances and each proposal coming forward will be assessed on its individual merits and on a business case basis.</p>
W10	<p><b><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR HOLDEN</u></b></p> <p>What current protection in the law does our central parkland have from development?</p> <p><b><u>Reply</u></b></p> <p>If the Council sought to dispose of public open space to accommodate development, it would be required under the Local Government Act 1972 to undertake public consultation by means of advertising its intentions in a newspaper circulating in the area and considering any objections to the proposed disposal which may be made to them.</p> <p>The normal requirements of the planning system would also apply to any development requiring planning permission which will include consideration against the policy in the Deposit Local Development Plan relating specifically to the Protection of Open Space. This policy indicates that development will not be permitted on areas of open space unless specific conditions are satisfied.</p>
W11	<p><b><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR HOLDEN</u></b></p> <p>Can you confirm the nature of the legal transfer of land from the Bute estate to the city of Cardiff in 1947?</p>

	<p>Was it for instance given to the city or people of Cardiff?</p> <p>Also, was there a covenant on the land and its use and to where does this extend?</p> <p><b><u>Reply</u></b></p> <p>The land was transferred to the Council to be used for “any local purpose or for the benefit of the inhabitants of the City”. I would be happy for Officers to provide you with a copy of the conveyance document that illustrates the extent of the boundaries. If you feel that this would be helpful please let me know.</p>
W12	<p><b><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR HOLDEN</u></b></p> <p>How much land from the original bequest is still under council influence?</p> <p><b><u>Reply</u></b></p> <p>There are five areas of land within the original bequest which have been subject to a disposal, these being the North Lodge and the land on which the original Royal Welsh College of Music &amp; Drama buildings are sited, both of which are within the Bute Park boundary. Within the area known as Blackweir, north of Bute Park, the properties known as Blackweir Cottages, Blackweir Farmhouse and Gabalfa Lodge have also been subject to a disposal.</p> <p>I would be more than happy for officers to meet with you if any clarification is required.</p>
W13	<p><b><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR HOLDEN</u></b></p> <p>How many people currently live within the boundaries of our central park?</p> <p><b><u>Reply</u></b></p> <p>I can confirm that there are no people who live within the boundaries</p>

	of Bute Park.
W14	<p><b><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR HOLDEN</u></b></p> <p>How many tree preservation orders currently exist in the Central parkland?</p> <p>Please provide a list of their locations.</p> <p><b><u>Reply</u></b></p> <p>None of the trees in the central parkland (Bute Park) are protected by Tree Preservation Orders (TPOs). This goes for the majority of Council parks.</p> <p>It is possible to protect Council trees and this is done where the Council's Arboricultural team in the Parks Service feel they lack sufficient control over them – for example, some woodlands that bound residential areas.</p> <p>In general terms however, Council trees are considered to be under good arboricultural management and not under threat of unsuitable felling or pruning. Following Government advice, it would therefore not be expedient to protect them by TPO.</p>

**LEADER (ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND PARTNERSHIPS)**

W15	<p><b><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOWDEN</u></b></p> <p>Have you considered establishing a Rail and Tram museum in Cardiff to celebrate the city's transport heritage given the proposed £4bn metro project?</p> <p><b><u>Reply</u></b></p> <p>To date, there has been no consideration of this opportunity. It can certainly be explored, but the challenge could be in finding a sustainable operating model in light of the current financial squeeze on museums.</p>
-----	---

**TRANSPORT, PLANNING AND SUSTAINABILITY**

W16	<p><b><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOWDEN</u></b></p> <p>Has the Council taken the opportunity to meet with Transport for London in preparation for the £4bn metro proposal?</p> <p><b><u>Reply</u></b></p> <p>No meetings are currently arranged with Transport for London, but this opportunity will be explored.</p> <p>We are currently arranging meetings with a range of other comparable public transport authorities such the Greater Manchester Public Transport Executive.</p>
W17	<p><b><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOWDEN</u></b></p> <p>How does the Council propose to invite investors to invest in the proposed £4bn metro project; how much will be needed from private investors; and how much will Cardiff residents be expected to contribute from Council tax should the external investment be insufficient?</p> <p><b><u>Reply</u></b></p> <p>Currently, although the Council is supportive of the Metro proposals there are no defined proposals or costs associated with the project that is being led by the Welsh Government.</p> <p>In due course the Council, in conjunction with Welsh Government and other partner authorities and organisations, will be developing a detailed business case and funding strategy. This will identify all the costs for development and operation of the systems and potential sources of long-term funding. I can assure you that that the Council will ensure that Cardiff residents get a fair and balanced deal.</p>

W18	<p><b><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOWDEN</u></b></p> <p>Part of the proposed £4bn metro project will rely on increased frequency of bus services. Are Cardiff Bus and other bus companies going to be in a position to deliver these given the cuts in their services on current routes, and the withdrawal of the bus subsidies from Welsh Government?</p> <p><b><u>Reply</u></b></p> <p>The Metro project will/should give increased commercial bus service opportunities to all operators in the City Region as the various modes of transport become more integrated. In addition there will be substantial developer contributions within Cardiff which can be used to establish new routes and services as Local Development Plan sites come on stream. Once established, these services should be able to operate without subsidy.</p> <p>Whilst both the payment per kilometre in service to operators from the Welsh Government and the rate of reimbursement for carrying concessionary pass holders is decreasing, we are not aware of any plans for the wholesale withdrawal of these payments.</p>
W19	<p><b><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOWDEN</u></b></p> <p>What discussions are taking place with neighbouring Local Authorities to find a Park &amp; Ride location in the north of the city?</p> <p><b><u>Reply</u></b></p> <p>Officers are talking with Rhondda Cynon Taf Council about the potential of locating Park &amp; Ride near the A470 as part of the regional plan to deliver the Metro. Furthermore, officers are also talking to developers about a new Park &amp; Ride site located close to Junction 33 of the M4 motorway, in accordance with the emerging LDP requirement.</p>

Signed: \_\_\_\_\_

Dated: \_\_\_\_\_